REMARKS

Status of the Claims

Claims 1-91 - (Canceled)

Claims 92-121 – (New)

Claim Rejections Under 35 U.S.C. § 102

Previously, the claims of the application have been rejected under 35 U.S.C. §

102(b) as being anticipated by Amado. Amado teaches an executive information

system for analyzing and interpreting large volumes of data to assist an executive with

the management of a business such as a fast-food branch, gas station, smaller rural

institution, etc. It uses data such as sales data, profit data, etc. from many different

sources to generate a diagnostics database. Various formulas are applied to the sales,

profit, etc. data in order to generate the diagnostics which are tied to the original data.

The diagnostics relate to the data analysis performed by the system and include such

advisories or warnings as "the companies debt is too large" (Col. 32, II. 22-26), "the

customer service department is falling behind" (Col. 33, II. 22-25), and there is a

simultaneous downturn in sales and profits for five products (Col. 43, II. 40-45). A user

is permitted to query the diagnostics and then act upon them. The system learns based

on a user's input and interaction with the system and apparent priorities so that the

generated diagnostics are meaningful to the user. Although the system provides

diagnostics that may be helpful to an executive in determining a course of action for the

company, the system does not provide an executive with *a set of decision alternatives*

to consider and does not assist the executive in *selecting one of the decision*

alternatives by filtering the decision alternatives according to *two or more performance*

criteria to exclude inferior decision alternatives and presenting the remaining decision alternatives, which are trade-offs with respect to each other, in scatterplots for further consideration.

Claims 92-101 are based on claims 15-25 of U.S. Patent 6,771,293. Claim 92 is based on claim 15 and has been extended to cover decision alternatives rather than simply design candidates. Decision alternatives are filtered according to a plurality of dominance criteria to produce a subset of decision alternatives that excludes inferior alternatives. The production of a set of filtered alternatives by comparing alternatives to each other and excluding inferior alternatives based on *two or more* dominance criteria is believed to patentably define the present invention when combined with the presentation of the filtered alternatives in a scatterplot according to the dominance criteria used. The only alternatives that remain in the filtered set are those that represent "trade-offs" such that none of the remaining alternatives are superior to the other alternatives *in every respect.* The presentation of these alternatives in a display then shows the "trade-offs" to the user.

Claims 102-121 also indicate clearly that the present invention filters a set of decision alternatives according to *multiple performance criteria* to produce a subset of decision alternatives that are trade-offs with respect to each other. The viewer of the present invention may be used to view the filtered decision alternatives that remain in the subset so that a user can explore the trade-offs.

Conclusion

Applicant respectfully submits that the Amado reference fails to teach a system or method for exploring a decision space comprising a plurality of decision alternatives, a filter for excluding alternatives that are inferior with respect to two or more performance attributes to produce a set of trade-offs, and a viewer for examining the filtered alternatives that remain in the decision space. In view of the foregoing claim amendments and accompanying remarks, the Applicant respectfully submits that the present application is properly in condition for allowance.

Respectfully submitted,

Date: July 19, 2005   By: Carol G. Stovsky

Carol G. Stovsky
Registration No.: 42,171
Standley Law Group LLP
495 Metro Place South, Suite 210
Dublin, Ohio 43017-5319
Tel.: 614-792-5555
Fax: 614-792-5536
cstovsky@standleyllp.com